

No W.11037/04/2011-CRSP  
Government of India  
Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation  
NBA Division

12<sup>th</sup> Floor, Paryavaran Bhawan,  
CGO Complex, Lodhi Road,  
New Delhi - 110003  
Date: 18.2.2013

To,

**Principal Secretary/ Secretary In-Charge of Rural Sanitation,  
All States / UTs**

Subject: Minutes of National consultation with State Ministers and State Secretaries In-charge of Rural Sanitation held on 20-21 December, 2012 at Scope complex, Lodhi Road, New Delhi.

Sir/Madam,

A copy of the Minutes of National consultation with State Ministers and State Secretaries In-charge of Rural Sanitation held on 20-21 December, 2012 at Scope complex, Lodhi Road, New Delhi is sent herewith for information and necessary action.

Yours faithfully,

  
(Pratima Gupta)  
Director (NBA)

Copy to :

- i. PS to Hon'ble Minister of State (I/C) DWS, GOI for bringing it to the kind notice of the Hon'ble Minister
- ii P.S. to Hon'ble Minister in-Charge of Rural Sanitation, All States / UTs - for bringing it to the kind notice of the Hon'ble Minister
- iii PS to Secretary, DWS, for bringing it to the kind notice of the Secretary

Copy also to : PS to JS (S&A)/PS to JS (Water)

✓ Dir (NIC) for placing on Website / DS (Fin)

**MINUTES OF NATIONAL CONSULTATION WITH STATE MINISTERS  
AND SECRETARIES IN-CHARGE OF RURAL SANITATION  
ON 20<sup>TH</sup> & 21<sup>ST</sup> DECEMBER, 2012  
AT SCOPE COMPLEX, NEW DELHI ORGANISED  
BY MINISTRY OF DRINKING WATER AND SANITATION, GOI.**

**DAY I – 20.12.2012**

1. A National Consultation with State Ministers and State Secretaries in charge of Rural Sanitation was held at SCOPE Complex, New Delhi on 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> December, 2012. The main objectives of the National Consultation meeting was to review and analyze the progress made so far in implementation of Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA), discuss various issues linked with implementation of NBA and identify changes, modifications, if any, for up-scaling the Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan for making India a Nirmal Bharat. Apart from State Ministers and State Secretaries in Charge of Rural Sanitation, the District and field functionaries, the NGOs, Technical experts and experts from International resource agencies participated in this consultation. A list of participants is enclosed.

2. **Proceedings on 20<sup>th</sup> December'2012** started with welcome and keynote address by Secretary (MDWS). In his opening remarks, **the Secretary (MDWS)** expressed that the Rural Drinking Water Programme and NBA have been identified as flagship programmes in the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan. He also informed that drinking water and sanitation has been identified as one of the six major issues in 56<sup>th</sup> National development Council Meeting held at New Delhi on 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2011. The Budget Outlay of Rs 10,500 crores have been allotted to NRDWP for Drinking Water and Rs.3, 500 crores have been allotted to NBA Programme for sanitation this year 2012-13. Moreover, the Budget outlay earmarked for 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan to this Ministry is 154% increase over the 11<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan.

3. Secretary stated that 60% of people defecating in the open in the world lived in India which means 626 million people in India defecate in the open as per the JMP Report, which is a National shame. Also as per the Census-2011, only 32.7% have sanitation coverage and this is the big challenge to the Country. He outlined the various implications of open defecation which can cause diseases to transmit easily; Poor hygiene and lack of sanitation contribute to about 88% of diarrhea deaths and gynecological problems to the girls and women who are forced to take bath in ponds with their clothes. Due to the Open defecation, there may also be a chance of contamination of Ground water. Secretary further stated that, improved sanitation frees girls and women from “imprisonment by daylight” as still many women in India can go for defecation only after dark.

4. Secretary also expressed a doubt whether the sanitation coverage data either submitted by states or as per Census 2011 includes insanitary toilets which dispose excreta in open drains leading to polluting ground water, and also whether it includes dysfunctional toilets. As per available figures, there are 12.76 lakh insanitary toilets in the rural areas out of which 5.86 lakh are manually scavenged. Secretary stressed that the manual scavenging has to be eliminated altogether in the entire country. Secretary also insisted that there is a need to fix the life of a typical toilet, which will avoid dysfunctional toilets also to be counted.

5. Secretary asked the states to identify the inefficiencies in the system preventing them from achieving their targets and to work out the modalities to handle the multiplicity of resources at their end for implementing sanitation programme smoothly. He further listed out the main points for discussion during day long deliberations as follows:

- Convergence issues between NBA and MGNREGS
- Menstrual hygiene issues
- Way of greater involvement of NGOs and KRCs under NBA (be it training demonstration, sanitation park, IEC, advocacy, hand-holding, promoting rural sanitary marts etc.
- Way forward to achieve the ODF status and Nirmal Bharat by 2022.

6. **Director (NBA)** in her presentation highlighted the agenda points to be taken up for discussion during this National Consultation meeting. She gave an overview of the NBA programme with specific mention on NBA-MGNREGS convergence, and other related issues concerning with the successful implementation of this programme.

7. Director (NBA) in her presentation highlighted the progress of States and urged the States to achieve 100% ODF status by 2022, the ultimate goal of NBA and also requested the states to accelerate the rate of construction of toilets. She also gave an overview of the state wise physical progress, performance in achievement of construction of IHHLs, School toilets, Anganwadi toilets and state wise financial progress such as, details of fund release and unspent balances lying with the states etc.

8. **The States which have the higher balance targets of IHHL** as per IMIS are Bihar (19%), West Bengal (9%), Uttar Pradesh (10%), Orissa (9%), Rajasthan (7%), Maharashtra (7%), Andhra- Pradesh(6%), Jharkhand(6%), Madhya Pradesh(5%) Tamil Nadu (5%), Karnataka (4%), Chhattisgarh (4%), Assam (4%), Jammu and Kashmir (3%), Gujarat (2%) and Punjab(1%).

9. **With respect to School Sanitation**, 12, 55,074 school toilets have been completed so far out of total project objective of 13, 75,234. As per directions of the Supreme Court, the balance should be completed before March, 2013. The progress of construction of toilets in school is poor so far this year in many of the states, despite the commitment made by the States of covering all schools by March 2013. The States which have higher balance targets of School Sanitation as per IMIS are **West Bengal (19%), Bihar (17%), UP (20%) and Rajasthan (13%)**. The States must coordinate with the Department of Education in finalising the targets for school toilets up to the year 2007 since, beyond 2007 the toilets are to be provided through the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) of Ministry of Human Resource Development. Secretary mentioned that it is important to monitor on IMIS or otherwise the implementation so as to comply with directives of Supreme Court.

10. **With respect to Anganwadi Sanitation** as against the total project objective of 534931, 4,22,603 toilets have been constructed so far. The States which have higher balance targets of Anganwadi Sanitation as per IMIS are **West Bengal (39%) Rajasthan (16%), Bihar (11%), Andhra Pradesh (6%), Assam (5%), UP (5%), Gujarat (5%), Jharkhand (4%) and Madhya Pradesh (3%)**. The States must coordinate with the Department of Women and Child Development in finalising the targets for Anganwadi Toilets. Secretary mentioned that this too needs to be monitored.

11. **In regard to unspent balance**, the States of **Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Jharkhand, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Rajasthan, Maharashtra, U.P. and West Bengal** are having very high opening balance. The states must take urgent and concrete steps to reduce opening balance by expediting implementation.

12. **In regard to dry latrines**, Director NBA mentioned that as per the NBA guidelines **Para 5.4.4** "Construction of bucket latrines is not permitted in the rural areas. The existing bucket latrines, if any, should be converted to sanitary latrines and the sharing pattern for incentive for the targeted beneficiaries shall be identical to that of construction of individual house hold latrines". She further informed that as per Census 2011, existence of 12.76 lakh insanitary latrines have been reported, out of which 5.86 lakh dry latrines reportedly are cleaned manually in the rural areas of the country. The State wise data of villages involved manual scavenging received from RGI has already been forwarded to all the States to formulate time bound action plans for conversion of existing bucket or dry latrines into sanitary latrines on a priority basis.

### 13. Feedback from States based on their performance

(i) (a) **Sikkim** stated that the state had already achieved NGP status way back in 2008, but the 2011 earthquake damaged existing houses and toilets which severely affected the sanitation programme. Under the earth quake rehabilitation scheme 7000 houses are being constructed with inbuilt toilets. The State has initiated pilot project in solid waste management. However with regard to conversion of Bio – degradable waste into compost, the state has the problem in processing time which takes more than 120 days instead of normal composting period of 30 to 60 days due to the low temperatures prevailing in the state.

(b) Sikkim could achieve the NGP status first in the Country because of strong political will at the state level, efficient IEC programme involving documentaries on cable television, banners, posters etc. Involvement of all stakeholders including NGOs in the campaign and assistance extended from IIT Roorkee for help in tackling problems in composting.

(c) Sikkim demanded more funds for reconstruction of toilets damaged by earthquakes and for converting single pit toilets to twin pit pour flush toilets. Even though the state has been declared ODF status, fresh baseline survey is absolutely necessary to take up the construction of toilets for the increased population & households.

(ii) **Jammu and Kashmir** explained that skewed planning and lack of follow up and shortage of district officers in 17 districts for implementation of the programme are the main reason for the poor progress. The state also mentioned that these issues have now been tackled and the state is now expediting the progress. The Schools and Anganwadi toilets which are in difficult areas are being attended now to achieve the target before March 2013.

(iii) (a) **Kerala** stated that the State has achieved 100% ODF status. 978 NGPs had earlier attained the Nirmal Status last year and the balance 19 GPs have also attained Nirmal gram recently. These includes two GPs that lie in high water table area. They have installed bio-digester toilets. These toilets have been constructed as community toilets.

(b) The representative of the State also informed that the factors that are helping the State to become Nirmal are:

- Kerala has a strong Panchayat system which is very active and this is one of the main reason for achieving success

- High literacy level
- Large number of the state's population earns their livelihood out of the country ( 10%) which has made the people conscious of sanitation
- The state has plenty of rainfall and water resources available.
- All the toilets constructed are twin pit pour flush toilets.

#### 14. **Presentation / Discussion on Convergence related issues with MGNREGS :**

(i) **Shri Ram Niwas, NBA Co-ordinator, Rajasthan** made a presentation on NBA and MGNREGS Convergence. He said that for clarity about convergence issues of NBA and MGNREGS, a State level workshop was organized. State has also issued detailed operational guidelines, guidelines for effective convergence with MGNREGS and new formats for simplification of Utilization Certificate. Joint Administrative and Financial Sanction of NBA/MNREGS & releases are being issued. Material for IHHL construction is supplied by GPs to Households. Simultaneously payment is being released for labour as per MGNREGA guidelines. After construction and use of toilets, rest of the payment of NBA is released to Households.

(ii) (a) **Shri S.Vijaykumar, Commissioner, PD & PR, Govt. of Tamilnadu** made a presentation on Convergence of NBA and MGREGS in Tamil nadu. He intimated that Govt. of Tamilnadu has issued detailed guidelines for convergence of NBA with MGNREGS. State Government is providing Rs. 2500 instead of Rs. 1400 for construction of Individual household latrines. Total unit cost of IHHLs is Rs. 11100. Convergence with MGNREGS has also started for Solid and Liquid Waste Management. State is also preparing a combined list of all the eligible beneficiaries from a Village Panchayat desirous of constructing Individual Household latrines (IHHL).

(b) State is employing only Job Card holders for the unskilled part of work for IHHL. Social Audit is done by Gram Sabha. Payment for skilled worker is to be made from material component of MGNREGS. There are some issues like (i) Availability of Materials on time (ii) Time Lag between the completion and payment. Dysfunctional toilets are a major challenge in the achievement of Nirmal Status of GPs identified for saturation approach.

(iii) **Shri Rajesh Bhusan, Joint Secretary (MGNREGS)** informed that Joint meeting of Principal Secretaries/Secretaries incharge of Rural Development and Rural Sanitation of States was organized on 29<sup>th</sup> August, 2012 at Unnati Conference, Krishi Bhawan. There after revised Guidelines on convergence of

NBA and MGNREGS on 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2012 in which many issues raised in the meeting was clarified. State may download these guidelines from [www.rural.nic.in](http://www.rural.nic.in).

(iv) **Secretary, Rural Development, Govt. of Orissa** said that the 21 person days of unskilled workers and 6 person days of skilled workers available under MGNREGS are more than the required amount for construction of IHHL. There is no problem in convergence of NBA with MGNREGS. He mentioned that Gram Sathi, employed through MoRD should also get incentive. In reply JS (MGNREGS) clarified that Gram Sathi is nothing but Mate and can be paid as per revised guidelines.

(v) **Secretary, PHED, Govt. of Chattisgarh** said that there are a lot of problems in convergence of NBA with MGNREGS. Low priority is given by Gram Panchayats for Sanitation.

(vi) **State representative from Andhra Pradesh** said that there is no problem in convergence of NBA with MGNREGS. He supported the convergence process. Online software has been developed for this purpose.

(vii) **Representative, Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh** said that convergence of NBA and MGNREGS is very complicated system and not feasible. Insufficient fund from MGNREGS and lack of priority for Sanitation work is main cause for delay in implementation of NBA. He has requested that the MGNREGS share of Rs.4500 also to be given from NBA funds.

(viii) **Representative, Govt. of Jharkhand** said that some Deputy Commissioners are releasing only Rs.2000- Rs.3000 for the construction of toilets from MGNREGS. JS (MGNREGS) informed that this has already been amended in the revised guidelines.

(ix) **Secretary, Panchayat and Rural Development Govt. of West Bengal** stated that the convergence of NBA and MGNREGS has been started in 9 districts of the State. Convergence is not working very well in West Bengal.

(x) **Representative from Govt. of Madhya Pradesh** said that, Madhya Pradesh is the first state which started convergence of NBA with MGNREGS and there is no problem in convergence of NBA with MGNREGS. But insufficient fund under MGNREGS is causing delay in meeting the project objectives.

(xi) **Representative from Govt. of Punjab** said that convergence between NBA and MGNREGS is not working well in Punjab. At present the state is utilizing NBA incentives and NABARD loan to beneficiary for construction of toilets. The state also intimated that the state is constructing the toilet at the unit cost of Rs. 14000/-. The IEC and construction activities are being facilitated by Sulabh International.

(xii) **Representative from Govt. of Uttar Pradesh** said that the state is facing lot of problems in convergence of NBA and MGNREGS due to the reason that, the MGNREGS and NBA programme are being implemented by different departments namely Department of Rural Development and Department of Panchayati Raj respectively. He further suggested that the fund from NBA should be given directly to GPs. He also requested to reduce targets of school and Anganwadi toilets. On this, he was informed that directions of Supreme Court must be followed.

(xiii) **Representative from Govt. of Assam** The main issue in Assam is that convergence between NBA and MGNREGS is not functioning smoothly at the ground level. The state is not able to get NGOs support in implementation of this model through convergence with MGNREGS. He has further mentioned that most of the GPs are having more than 1000 households and requested to add 2 or 3 slabs such as 500-1000, 1000-2000 and more than 3000 in NBA Guidelines for SLWM, & moreover the outlays should be project based, i.e. as per the cost worked out in the DPR.

(xiv) **Representative from Govt. of Bihar** informed that transferring of funds directly to GPs is not a very good practice in Bihar. Getting the UCs from GPs is very difficult due to administrative reasons. Convergence of NBA and MGNREGS is not working properly in the state due to lower priority given for sanitation by GP.

(xv) **Joint Collector, Khamman district, Andhra Pradesh** informed that many GPs have completed MGNREGS targets of 100 days employment in this year. He has stated that, in the construction of IHHL, Leach pit system is not working in high water table areas in the state and needs alternate technology. Secretary (DWS) suggested that DRDO model may be tried on a pilot basis in areas having high water table, but toilet effluent be monitored regularly for BOD/COD/Coliform parameters.



## 15. PRESENTATIONS BY NGOS AND RESOURCE AGENCIES

(i) **Dr. P K Jha, Consultant, NRC (Sanitation and Waste Management)** made a presentation on Technical options for SLWM, specifically regarding Waste stabilization ponds (WSP), technology for liquid waste management. He mentioned that waste stabilization ponds (WSP) are a low-cost, low-energy, low-maintenance and, above all, a sustainable method of wastewater treatment. There is complete and safe reuse of effluent for agriculture purpose. Use of inorganic fertilizer can be reduced substantially. Operation and Maintenance cost of WSP are much lower. He also discussed the Duckweed based waste water treatment. The advantage of this technology is direct economic return from waste water treatment system in terms of pisciculture. The way forward is greater adoption of solid and liquid waste management practices in rural areas.

(ii) (a) **The representative of DRDO made a presentation on Bio –digester toilets, & stated that it is a viable and cost effective technology that can be implemented in all the states. The technology can be implemented under all conditions both at high altitudes and deserts. It has also been successfully tested in places like Lakshwadweep which has high water table. The technology is now being successfully implemented by the Indian Railways in selected trains.**

(b) The biggest advantage of the technology is that there is no need to clean the bio tank for life and no electric power is needed. It is a very effective technology that can prove to be very successful.

(c) This technology was applauded by J&K and Punjab for giving solution for high altitude places and for addressing the issues of ground water contamination. Further DRDO was asked by Orissa to explore some structural change in the design of the toilets being implemented in Orissa by DRDO. It was also suggested that the unit cost of bio-digester be brought down.

(iii) (a) **M/s Quicksand –WASH UNITED** made a presentation on recently concluded **Nirmal Bharat Yatra** in five States. It was mentioned that more than 16,000 people participated at all the five venues during the Yatra. The Yatra consisted of innovative approaches like 25 different games on sanitation, mobile labs and live performances on sanitation themes.

(b) The agency said that after the success of Nirmal Bharat Yatra in terms of creating awareness and raising advocacy issues, they are designing a smaller version of the Yatra at the State level called 'Nirmal Gram Yatra' which will be having penetration into the Gram Panchayats.

(c) Many States e.g. **Uttarakhand and Assam appreciated this approach and requested that** such Yatra should also be organized in their states to bring focus on Sanitation.

(iv) **Sulabh International** made presentation on technological options for construction of toilets. It was mentioned that the technology adopted by the organization (Twin pit pour flush) has been tested across India, and in other countries like China and has proved to be very successful.

(v) **Representative of Govt. of Haryana** made a presentation on SLWM. She discussed SLWM project in Kurushetra district. She mentioned that presently these projects are being implemented in 32 Gram Panchayats. As part of this project, at Household level –two separate bins for bio-degradable and non-biodegradable waste are maintained and door to door collection of these waste are being done by the project personnel. Sheds have been constructed at community level for depositing waste after segregation into bio-degradable and non bio-degradable waste. Non-biodegradable wastes are directly sold to Kabadis. She stated that after 8-9 months, the project will become self sustainable.

(vi) **Ms. Smita Mishra, Senior Economist, World Bank** made presentation on Sanitation Programs in World Bank Assisted Project States. She said that World Bank has supported GoI for last two decades in water supply and sanitation in various States. Hence, World Bank programme is complementary to TSC/NBA.

(vii) **Presentation by Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative Council (WSSCC):** Ms. Archana Patkar from WSSCC made a presentation on Menstrual Hygiene. She stressed on the need for managing menstruation hygienically and safe disposal solutions. She requested that the menstrual hygiene issues should be included in the NBA guidelines.

(viii) **Presentation by FINISH:** Shri Sadanand Bhawe, Programme Director, FINISH made a presentation on Accelerating Rural Sanitation Coverage. The Programme has been developed as a public private partnership to provide sustainable sanitation solutions to 1 million households across various states in India. He also said that the corporate sector be persuaded/encouraged to join the Sanitation initiative by channelizing their funds under Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).

## DAY II – 21.12.2012

16. **The second day's proceedings on 21<sup>st</sup> December, 2012** started with Welcome and lighting of lamp. The Hon'ble Minister of State (I/C) for Drinking Water and Sanitation Shri Bharatsinh Solanki formally launched the newly designed E- News letter for the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation, which will be highlighting the best practices in sanitation adopted by various state governments. The Hon'ble Minister also released the newly formulated Nirmal Gram Puraskar Guidelines both in English and Hindi.

17. **Secretary (MDWS) on his Opening Remarks** stated that 60% of people that defecated in the open in the world lived in India. In terms of numbers, 626 million people in India defecate in the open as per the Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP) Report. This was a national shame. Also as per the Census-2011, only 32.7% have sanitation coverage and this is the very big challenge to the Country and it is important that the country obtains ODF status even before 2022. He said that the Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA) has been identified as a flagship programme of Government of India in the 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan. He also informed that drinking water and sanitation has been identified as one of the six major issues in 56<sup>th</sup> National development Council Meeting held at New Delhi on 22<sup>nd</sup> October 2011. A Budget Outlay of Rs 10,500 crores has been allotted to NRDWP for Drinking Water and Rs.3,500 crores has been allotted to NBA Programme for sanitation this year 2012-13. Moreover, a Budget outlay of Rs.34,500 Crores has been earmarked to the Ministry for 12<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan which is 154% increase comparing to the 11th Plan.

18. Secretary said that various issues related to NBA implementation in States have been discussed on the day 1 of this National consultation on 20<sup>th</sup> December'12. He summed up the main points as under:

19. **Jammu and Kashmir** explained that skewed planning and lack of follow up and shortage of district officers in 17 districts for implementation of the programme are the main reason for the poor progress. The state also mentioned that these issues have now been tackled and are expediting the progress now. The Schools and Anganwadi toilets which are in difficult areas are being attended now to achieve the target before March 2013.

- Sikkim has already been declared an ODF state last year but expressed the necessity of a fresh baseline survey due to the damage that occurred during recent earthquake and due to the increased population/households.

- Kerala informed that it has attained ODF status and requested to send a central team for evaluation to declare it officially by GoI.
- The issue of dysfunctional toilets was raised by many states. A permanent solution to overcome this issue needs to be formulated.
- There is a need to learn and share the best practices from better performing states.
- Nearly all the states expressed their reservations and difficulties in implementing the convergence with MGNREGS & this convergence was actually dragging down the target achievements. States said that the Department of Rural Development / Panchatati Raj are not giving priority to sanitation sector in implementing convergence of MGNREGS with NBA in the field, and not allotting the necessary MGNREGS funds. To speed up execution and to achieve ODF before 2022, there was a need to increase the unit cost of a toilet within NBA guidelines itself.
- All the states should come up with a Strategic Plan to attain ODF status.
- From 2007, Sarva shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) is constructing the Schools in Villages with in built toilet facilities. But the schools constructed before 2007 have to be provided toilets under NBA. At present there are around 200,000 schools that do not have toilets. As per Supreme Court directions, these schools have to be provided toilets by March 2013.
- Maintenance of toilets is a big issue, and states needs to look at this and come up with concrete solutions.
- Several states expressed the need to increase unit costs of IHHLs, School and Anganwadi toilets
- Some states also expressed reservation about handing over of NGP to the states and requested that the entire award money should come from the central government as in the previous years.
- NGOs have a big role to play in NBA especially in motivation and advocacy activities.

## 20. Inaugural Speech by Hon'ble Minister of State (I/C), MDWS

(i) The **Hon'ble Minister of State (I/C) of Drinking Water and Sanitation, Shri Bharatsinh Solanki** in his address said that Sanitation has been one of the areas covered in the successive Five Year Plans from the Second Five Year plan onwards. The Central Rural Sanitation Programme (CRSP) was started in the country in 1986. Subsequently the Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC) was started in 1999. Both CRSP and the TSC were limited in its operations and the Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA) launched in the first year of the 12<sup>th</sup> Five year Plan, attempts to make a drastic change in the construction and use of sanitation facilities by the rural population. Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan has brought in several changes in